(SRI A. BHEEMAPPA NAIK)

Ministers not to claim T.A. and D.A. while they sermonised to the guests not to claim them, as the times were difficult ?

Sri K. HANUMANTHAIYA.—I have already answered that. They usually go to Mysore and they claim T.A. and D.A. as per the rules.

Travelling Allowance of Ministers since the establishment of Responsible Government.

Q.—217. **Sri B. V. NARAYANA REDDY** (Bagepalli-Gudibanda).—

Will the Government be pleased to state :—

the yearwar particulars of salaries and travelling allowances of Ministers and the amount spent on furnishing Ministers' quarters and on cars, since the establishment of Responsible Government ?

A.—**Sri K. HANUMANTHAIYA** (Chief Minister).—

The figures are available in each year's budget statements.

Sri B. V. NARAYANA REDDY.—I would appeal to the Speaker for protection to the members from hearing irrelevant answers from the Minister.

Mr. SPEAKER.—You may put a supplementary question. This is not the time to make any comment. The reply given is that the answer is available in the Budget.

Sri B. V. NARAYANA REDDY.—Why not he bring the Budget copies and read out the figures here, Sir ?

Mr. SPEAKER.—You can put another question.

Sri B. V. NARAYANA REDDY.—I must know the Budget Sir. My question is based on that.

Sri L. SIDDAPPA (Channagiri).—The question asked is not about the Budget provision, but about the expenditure actually incurred. Sir, that information is not available in the Budget Estimates. The Government has to furnish that information.

Sri K. HANUMANTHAIYA.—The Hon'ble Member will find it in the Accounts Column.

Sri J. MOHAMED IMAM.—Sir, this is an ingenious way of giving answers. Specific items should be given. The question is that the particulars of salaries and travelling allowances of Ministers during the past five years may kindly be given. So for each year, the figures provided in the Budget may not show the actual amounts that have been spent during the year. They must calculate and give me the figures for each year of amounts actually spent upto now. The answer must be specific.

Mr. SPEAKER.—I think the Hon'ble Chief Minister will find out and give the amount actually spent from the date of the establishment of Responsible Government.

Sri K. HANUMANTHAIYA.—This is the position, Sir. If a general statement like this is asked—"spread over a period of 5 or 6 years", the volume of the answer will be such that Government would be put to the necessity of straining themselves to furnish answers. If questions are asked which require enormous amount of labour, it would not be conducive to the economy of expenditure which all of us have in view.

Sri A. BHEEMAPPA NAIK (Molakalmuru).—Sir, with due deference to the Chief Minister, I beg to submit that the answer can be given in 5 or 6 lines. After all what has been asked is the salary of the Ministers and T.A. and D.A. of the Ministers. How can we go on if the Administration goes on answering this way and if the Chief Minister says that the answer can be found in the Accounts Column ? How can one find the actual expenditure ? The allotment only is found there.

Sri L. SIDDAPPA.—In the previous one or two years, the actuals are given in the Budget figures.

Mr. SPEAKER.—If time is not sufficient, sufficient time may be taken and if possible, the information sought may be made available to the members.

Sri J. MOHAMED IMAM.—Will the answers be provided before the close of the Session ?

Sri K. HANUMANTHAIYA.—I may straightaway say that I make no

promise tentatively. Let him ask the supplementary questions. I would be very happy if the House discusses this question and gives a clear direction to the Government as to what exactly the questions are and their scope. There are uniform rules and we may follow the procedure instead of stray and casual remarks.

Mr. SPEAKER.—The question is quite clear. I must tell the Hon'ble the Chief Minister that they are seeking this information relating to certain items of expenditure since the establishment of Responsible Government. If it is not possible to furnish reply now, time will be given to answer the question.

Sri K. HANUMANTHAIYA.—Then again the question arises, Sir.

Mr. SPEAKER.—The question is also relevant and is admissible.

Sri K. HANUMANTHAIYA.—It is the length of the answer that is required.

Sri A. BHEEMAPPA NAIK.—Even if the answer is the longest one, it must be given Sir.

Sri J. MOHAMED IMAM.—Will you allow me to put the supplementaries Sir.

Mr. SPEAKER.—That becomes unnecessary.

Sri L. SIDDAPPA.—The situation is this, Mr. Speaker. I have no choice but to defer this question and take it up at a later stage provided Government places its answer on the table within the close of this session. But the Chief Minister cannot give the assurance.

Mr. SPEAKER.—We cannot help it.

Sri J. MOHAMED IMAM.—The privilege of the members is: when a question is tabled before this House, it is the duty of the Government to furnish answer to that question and if the Speaker directs that the question may be taken up later on and the answer should be furnished by that time, then it is the duty of the Government to furnish answer by that time even employing extra staff. But the Government cannot escape and they have no right to escape from giving the answer and so if we are not given an assurance then it really involves the fundamental breach of the privilege of the members which I will have to raise before this House.

Sri K. HANUMANTHAIYA.—May I submit this, Sir, In one breath he raises the question of economy in expenditure and in another breath he says employ special staff. I may state that I am prepared to employ a special staff for the purpose of answering any question that is asked. I am certain that there will not be any criticism by anybody that we have increased the expenditure.

Sri J. MOHAMED IMAM.—I want the answer to be furnished before the close of the Session.

Sri K. HANUMANTHAIYA.—I am prepared to appoint a Special Branch. The lengthiness of the answers does require a special staff and if it is the desire of the House, I am prepared to do that according to rule.

1 P.M.

Sri J. MOHAMED IMAM.—Rule 29 says:

> "(1) As soon as answers to questions which have not been disallowed are received by the Secretary, a list of questions and answers shall be prepared in such manner as the Speaker may determine....."
>
> It is just to determine the manner of answers.

Sri K. HANUMANTHAIYA.—That is conceded.

Sri J. MOHAMED IMAM.—

> ".....and a copy thereof shall be made available for the use of every member not later than one hour before the meeting for which the list is prepared.
>
> "(2) As far as possible, replies to as many questions for each day as would dispose of all the questions during the session (the distribution among the several days of the meeting being equal) shall be sent by the Government to the Secretary at least 2 days before each day....."

All these provisions are mandatory and the Government cannot escape their responsibility and it is imperative on their part to provide answers to

(SRI J. MOHAMED IMAM)

these questions. No further discussion is necessary. Your discretion is there. The rights of the House are there. The responsibilities of the Government are there. Taking these three factors into consideration, whatever is your wish and discretion, it will be accepted.

Mr. SPEAKER.—Is it the plea of the Government that want of establishment or want of time or the fact that information is available in the respective budgets is the reason why the answer is not given ?

Sri K. HANUMANTHAIYA.—The Secretariat staff, in pursuance of the criticism made, has been reduced, as you are aware. That is one reason. Secondly, the questions asked are so stereotyped that they require very lengthy printing. These are the two difficulties.

Sri L. SIDDAPPA.—The Leader of the House has raised a very curious point. I invite attention of the Hon'ble Speaker to Rule 26.

"(1) Subject to the provisions of these rules a question may be asked for the purpose of obtaining information on a matter of public interest.

(2) The right to ask a question is governed by the following conditions:"

I am inviting your kind attention to item (i).

"(i) A question shall not be of excessive length."

When a question has been asked and you have exercised your discretion and ordered that it be admitted, then it is the duty of the Government to furnish replies to the questions asked and ordered by you to be furnished. And again the Leader of the House said that the House may discuss this matter and give a direction as to whether answers have got to be furnished for this question. I submit, in the face of the provision of the rules, whether it is open to the House to discuss this matter once again and give a direction to the Government whether a particular question has got to be answered or not. In these circumstances, now that you have exercised your discretion and after you have admitted the question and after you have asked the Government to furnish the answer to this question, whether Government could resist in furnishing answers to this question, is the point for consideration.

Sri K. HANUMANTHAIYA.—All the arguments are unnecessary. Nobody has refused to furnish the answer. The answer will be furnished. Whether that answer is satisfactory or not, is the question. Therefore, no rule need be quoted and no argument need be advanced. Whether the answer furnished is satisfactory or whether a detailed statement has to be given separately is the matter for consideration and, as I have said, I have left it to your discretion.

Mr. SPEAKER.—The question is proper and relevant and since it has been admitted by the Chair, the Government are bound to answer. But the Hon'ble the Chief Minister says that the answer would be of excessive length and will come under 26 (2) (i). He also states that want of time and adequate staff and the labour and expenditure involved in collecting the information have rendered it not possible to furnish the details within the prescribed time. I may also add that information set forth in accessible documents need not be furnished and the answer now given and printed and distributed to Hon'ble Members refers to those documents. In spite of all this, I have requested the Government to give the details and they have agreed to do so, provided sufficient time is given to them.

Proposals to transfer officials of the Secretariat to District Offices.

Q.—293. Sri A. V. NARASIMHA REDDY (Bangalore South).—

Will the Government be pleased to state :—

(*a*) whether there is a proposal to transfer officials of the Secretariat to District Offices ;

(*b*) if so, their intention for effecting such transfers;

(*c*) the procedure adopted for such transfers; whether it is inefficiency or any other consideration?